

**DATE:** March 19, 2019

**TO:** Board of Trustees

**FROM:** Trustee Bridget Stirling

**SUBJECT:** Motion re: New School Construction Projects

**REFERENCE:** [Trustees' Handbook – Section 5.2.2 – Notices of Motion](#)

---

## ISSUE

Notice of motion was served at the March 5, 2019, Board meeting.

## BACKGROUND

Infrastructure is one of the Board of Trustees' main advocacy areas for 2019, and trustees are exploring a range of solutions to address issues around deferred maintenance and school construction. While the Board has discussed the issue of public-private partnerships (P3s) in school construction and maintenance, the Board of Trustees has not to date come to a clear position on the construction of schools using P3 models. The Board is accountable for responsible stewardship of public resources and should continue to explore mechanisms to build schools in more efficient and effective ways; however, P3 models have repeatedly failed across Canada, and the evidence for their continuation is weak.

## RELATED FACTS

Public-private partnerships have been shown repeatedly to be both more costly and less effective as a means of building school infrastructure, both across Canada and in Alberta.

- In 2010, Nova Scotia's auditor general noted that school boards could operate their buildings at a lower cost than P3 operators, finding that the province would have saved \$53 million by building their 39 P3 schools as public infrastructure rather than as P3s. In 2017, the government of Nova Scotia spent \$49.3 million to take over public ownership of that province's P3 schools, citing lower costs that could be realized through public ownership rather than leasing of the buildings.
- New Brunswick's P3 Evergreen Park School was found by that province's auditor general to have cost \$900,000 more than the project would have cost as a public build.
- The government of Manitoba cancelled plans to build P3 schools after finding that five schools could be built using a public model for the same costs as four schools as P3s.
- In 2014, the government of Alberta cancelled the construction of 19 P3 schools, citing a savings of \$14 million by building those schools as public infrastructure rather than through a P3 model.
- In a 2015 report, Edmonton Public infrastructure staff noted that existing P3 agreements do not adequately allow for the construction of community partner spaces with new schools and that additional funds and agreements would be required to build these spaces with schools.
- A 2014 report to the Board of Trustees notes additional concerns related to timely maintenance and the ability to make modifications as related to P3 schools.

## RECOMMENDATION

**That the Edmonton Public School Board of Trustees affirms its support for publicly funded, publicly owned, and publicly accountable infrastructure projects and will advocate for all new school construction projects to be built as public projects, not public-private partnerships.**

**OPTIONS**

1. Approve the recommendation.
2. Provide feedback and request changes to the recommendation for approval.

**ATTACHMENTS and APPENDICES**

- ATTACHMENT I Alberta Schools Alternative Procurement (ASAP) and Public, Private Partnership (P3) Successes and Challenges (Response to Request for Information #023)
- ATTACHMENT II Standardized School Designs within the Context of Approved Provincial Designs (Response to Request for Information #089)

BS:km

**DATE:** June 24, 2014

**TO:** Board of Trustees

**FROM:** Darrel Robertson, Superintendent of Schools

**SUBJECT:** Alberta Schools Alternative Procurement (ASAP) and Public, Private Partnership (P3) Successes and Challenges (Response to Request for Information #023)

**ORIGINATOR:** David Fraser, Executive Director Corporate Services

**RESOURCE STAFF:** Ken Erickson, Terri Gosine, Roland Labbe, Garry Padlewski, Larry Schwenneker

**REFERENCE:** April 22, 2014, Board Meeting (Trustee Martin)

---

## ISSUE

The following information was requested:

Provide information on the successes and challenges experienced working within a P3 model for the ASAP schools.

## BACKGROUND

ASAP is a program that the Alberta Government developed to reduce delivery time and cost of building new schools. A P3 project bundles school construction along with the financing and maintenance over a 30 year life span. After 30 years the maintenance of the school is returned back to the District.

A total of nine schools have been received by the District under this program. Esther Starkman, Florence Hallock, A. Blair McPherson, Johnny Bright, Dr. Donald Massey and Elizabeth Finch were the six schools received by the District in 2010. Major-General Griesbach, Bessie Nichols and Michael Strembitsky schools were received in 2012.

## CURRENT SITUATION

Since the inception of the ASAP schools, Edmonton Public Schools (EPSB) staff have encountered challenges and successes with the changes resulting from the ASAP and P3 structure.

## KEY POINTS

The successes are identified as:

- The schools were constructed in a short timeline allowing EPSB to provide nine new schools to serve developing neighbourhoods.
- The traditional method of design-build would not have provided the schools in the same time frame.
- Since each school was the same standard design, over time the contractor became more efficient with the construction.
- Unique, individually designed schools would have resulted in higher architectural costs.
- In the ASAP I and ASAP II programs all schools were built identical in design and programming.

The challenges are identified as:

- A great deal of time was required clarifying the roles of EPSB staff, Alberta Infrastructure staff and the third-party maintenance provider contractor staff.
- The process for schools to request maintenance, repair or modifications must occur with the third-party maintenance provider, rather than through the standard Facilities Service Order desk. There are times when responsibility is not clear and emergent work is delayed.
- The third-party maintenance provider does not employ a full complement of trades staff. When a problem arises or a modification is requested, the maintenance provider requires an external trade contractor to assess a problem or provide a modification quote prior to determining cost and timeline for the repair or modification.
- Changes or modifications to the building or its equipment require the cost of the item, cost of the modification and cost of maintenance for the remainder of the contract until the school is turned over to EPSB. This makes the cost of changes appear as inflated.

#### **ATTACHMENTS & APPENDICES**

N/A

KE:kk

**DATE:** May 19, 2015

**TO:** Board of Trustees

**FROM:** Darrel Robertson, Superintendent of Schools

**SUBJECT:** Standardized School Designs within the Context of Approved Provincial Designs (Response to Request for Information #089)

**ORIGINATOR:** Lorne Parker, Acting Executive Director, Infrastructure

**RESOURCE STAFF:** Josephine Duquette, Terri Gosine, Roland Labbe, Christopher Wright

**REFERENCE:** March 3, 2015 Board Meeting (Trustee Gibson)

---

## ISSUE

The following information was requested: Provide information regarding whether standardized school designs that incorporate flexible, multi-purpose space are available within the context of approved Provincial designs.

## BACKGROUND

The Government of Alberta requires all new school projects to conform to the space guidelines articulated in the [Alberta School Capital Manual - Appendix C: Education Design Standards](#). Multi-purpose space is space that can typically be used for more than one instructional focus or program. All school types listed in the *Education Design Standards* include an allocation for classroom(s) categorized as ancillary space which is described as “*instructional areas used for drama, music, arts and other multi-purposes.*”

## CURRENT SITUATION

All school designs, whether commissioned by school jurisdictions or by the Government of Alberta on behalf of jurisdictions, allocate space in accordance with the *Education Design Standards*, which includes provision for ancillary classrooms that can serve or be described as multi-purpose. There are classrooms categorized as ancillary provided in standard-core school designs, which are template school designs developed by the Government of Alberta as part of the recent public-private partnership (P3) programs such as Alberta Schools Alternative Procurement (ASAP) and Building Alberta Schools Construction Program (BASCP). Standard-core school designs will be utilized to deliver recently announced school projects to reduce design timelines and deliver school facilities as quickly as possible. Variations to the designs may be considered where achievable within design budgets and project delivery timelines.

A number of standard-core design school projects in Alberta have been altered to accommodate a school partnership (Attachment I). The Government of Alberta does not fund design alterations or construction within the school project budget. Each project requires agreements and financial security to be in place for project scope outside of approved school project budgets, prior to provincial approval to proceed to construction.

**KEY POINTS**

- All school designs, whether commissioned by school jurisdictions or by the Government of Alberta on behalf of a jurisdiction, allocate space in accordance with the [Alberta School Capital Manual - Appendix C: Education Design Standards](#).
- All school types listed in the *Education Design Standards* include an allocation for classroom(s) categorized as ancillary space, which is described as “*instructional areas used for drama, music, arts and other multi-purposes.*”
- There are classrooms categorized as ancillary provided in standard-core school designs.
- Partner space requires additional design considerations, while floor plans for the balance of the school can still reflect standard core design.
- The District would require that additional agreements and funds be in place with partner entities prior to proceeding with either the design or construction of partner space.

**ATTACHMENTS & APPENDICES**

ATTACHMENT I Standard-Core Design Schools Altered for Partner Facilitation

RL:gm

## **Standard-Core Design Schools Altered for Partner Facilitation**

### **Isabel Campbell School K-8 (Grande Prairie Public School District)**

#### **The City of Grande Prairie Partnership Space**

The Grande Prairie Public School District (GPPSD) has developed a partnership with the City of Grande Prairie to include a space within the school of approximately 80m<sup>2</sup>. This space will be designed to the City of Grande Prairie requirements and will include a separate entrance from the front of the school that will be accessed through a vestibule. There will be four separate office spaces that will be used by different user groups throughout the week.

### **Riverstone K-8 (Grande Prairie Public School District)**

#### **YMCA**

The GPPSD has developed a partnership with the YMCA to include a daycare space within the school of approximately 100m<sup>2</sup>. This space will be designed to the YMCA requirements and will include a separate entrance from the front of the school and will be accessed through a vestibule with boot racks for the children.

### **St. Mary School - Beaverlodge K-9 (Grande Prairie Catholic Separate School District)**

Grande Prairie Catholic Separate School District has approved to increase the 430m<sup>2</sup> gymnasium size by 165m<sup>2</sup> to 595m<sup>2</sup> and has a partnership with the Town of Beaverlodge to provide a Community Kitchen at a total size of 60m<sup>2</sup> which will be funded separately. It has been located adjacent to the Home Economics Classroom for efficiencies to help with food preparation and serving. A separate exterior entrance was provided to avoid public use during school hours. The location of the kitchen also offers access to the gymnasium and the main gathering space providing flexibility to serve both spaces. The kitchen will be a future development and will be built as a shell that will make allowances for architectural, mechanical and electrical requirements.

### **Royal Oaks K-9 (Grande Prairie Catholic Separate School District)**

#### **The City of Grande Prairie Partnership Space**

The City of Grande Prairie requested that the school design accommodate a future 300 square meter Field House. The construction budget of \$19.7 million does not include the construction of the proposed Field House. The school has been designed to accommodate the Field House with an additional 32 square meters of circulation space for Field House access from the central gathering space, and structural foundations and gymnasium walls are designed to handle the future Field House addition. The City of Grande Prairie will need to provide funding for the additional circulation space and structure.

### **École Barrie Wilson School K-9 (Red Deer Public School District)**

#### **Red Deer Public Library**

The community contributed 150m<sup>2</sup> to the school's programmed library area of 240m<sup>2</sup>, creating a library of 390m<sup>2</sup> that is shared by the school and the community.